



1 OCTOBER MEMORIAL COMMITTEE
Clark County Government Center, BCC Chambers
500 S. Grand Central Parkway
Las Vegas, NV 89155

July 26, 2023
 9:00 AM

MINUTES

Board/Council Members: Tennille Pereira, Chairperson
 Karessa Royce, Vice Chairperson
 Harold Bradford
 Robert Fielden
 Rebecca Holden
 Kelly McMahill
 Mynda Smith

1. Call to Order, Roll Call, Pledge of Allegiance, and Moment of Silence.
Meeting called to order at 9:05 AM by Chairperson Tennille Pereira.

2. Public Comment.
Public comment by public audience member, Sue Ann Cornwell.

3. Approval of the Agenda for July 26, 2023 *(for possible action)*.
MOTION by **Karessa Royce**
2nd MOTION by **Kelly McMahill**
Action PASSED / Unanimous (7-0)

4. Approval of Minutes for March 15, 2023 *(for possible action)*.
MOTION by **Kelly McMahill**
2nd MOTION by **Harold Bradford**
Action PASSED / Unanimous (7-0)

5. Review and approve scores from finalist submittals *(for possible action)*.
Finals scores reviewed by the Memorial Committee.

Supplier	Total
1	87.83
2	81.83
3	80.83
4	79.17
5	73.83

Motion to take the top scored design as the primary team and the second scored as the alternate.

MOTION by Robert Fielden
2nd MOTION by Karessa Royce
Action PASSED / Unanimous (6-0)

Mynda Smith abstains from voting.

6. Announce the 1st place finalist and alternate to be presented at the first Board of County Commissioners meeting in September 2023 (*not an action item*).
1st Primary Team: JCJ Architecture
2nd Alternate Team: OLIN + Andy Scott
7. Committee to discuss next steps (*not an action item*).
Committee next steps is to take the design concept of finalist to the Board of County Commissioners for final approval on September 5, 2023.
8. Donation report by staff (*not an action item*).
\$58,355.68
9. Report by staff regarding monthly summary of activities (*not an action item*).
Report on pins inventory and distribution by Mickey Sprott.
Upcoming 1 October Memorial Committee Creative Expressions Exhibit on September 11, 2023.
10. Identify emerging issues to be addressed by staff or by the Committee; receive updates on activities and direct staff accordingly (*not an action item*).
None.
11. Comments by the General Public.
Public comment by public audience member, Sue Ann Cornwell.

Public comments sent to 1OctoberMemorial@ClarkCountyNV.Gov (*see attachments*).
12. Adjournment.
Meeting adjourned at 9:54 AM.

Dear Committee members,

I am writing to ask that you please consider carefully your selections in the proposals. While I feel that all five teams did an amazing job, there are a few things I feel warrant extra consideration.

I ask you to reflect back to the weeks and months following the 9/11 attacks. We all witnessed and participated in the overwhelming patriotism that our fellow countrymen displayed in support of our fallen Americans, including those first responders who selflessly ran straight into harm's way to save total strangers. While I wasn't alive during the attacks on Pearl Harbor, from every account that I've read, our country responded with that same overwhelming patriotism. While visiting these memorials, we may remember and reflect on the outpouring of love from the community, but we are there to remember and pay respect to the thousands of lives lost. I say all of this to stress the importance of the 1 October memorial in recognizing the 58 angels first and foremost while still paying respect to the community and first responders.

With that said, I feel that the Olin team has best represented the requirements of the committee. Not only did they dive into and represent the history of the Las Vegas community, but they also spoke specifically about bringing a sense of hope throughout the pain, exhaustion, and suffering. As I have navigated these nearly six years without my husband, —, and continued to raise our boys without their father, hope and faith were the only things that kept me going during some of those darkest moments. I had to come home and explain to two young boys the senseless death of their father and how we had to hold onto hope in the darkness because that is what he would want us to do. I told them, "We are the three musketeers now, but we will get through this. Your dad wouldn't want us to give up." It was that hope and faith that got us to where we are today. When Olin was presenting and discussing the hopefulness during dark times, I immediately was able to connect with their message. Olin's design brings the hope well are striving for, yet holds onto the "country and western" feel of country music in a serene and peaceful setting designed to honor the 58, but also the community and first responders.

Additionally, as I worked with each team, they all asked if country music should be incorporated into the design. While the obvious answer is yes, it isn't that easy. After surviving that night and losing —, there are some songs that can be emotional triggers for me. Meanwhile, songs that don't bother me may trigger the next survivor. Olin's design of the soundwave walkway to God Bless America incorporates a precious memory to many while not setting up potential triggers to visitors while still paying homage to country music.

Aside from bringing hope during those dark hours, incorporating country music in a subtle and non-triggering format, the Olin design has an openness to it that can allow any survivor struggling with claustrophobia to feel at ease. It also allows visitors worldwide access with their digital

platform. With so many of the 58 angels being from all over the country and Canada, this platform can allow for family and friends that are unable to travel, or for those who are apprehensive to visit, due to losing their angel, the ability to still interact with the memorial.

Thank you for all that you have done to honor our 58 and for taking the time to consider my thoughts.

(Email End.)

After careful consideration, our family has selected the Angel Wing design by Paul Murdoch Architect as our top choice for the memorial. Our daughter, —, is one of the 58 angels and we feel this design best represents the 58 angels and all of the Rt. 91 family.

We are so thankful to all of the committee members for your countless hours put into this project. We are also grateful that you listened to our constant plea to always remember the 58 angels.

(Email End.)

Dear Committee:

I know this will be a tough decision and we wanted to make sure we shared our voice and choice for the memorial. Overwhelmingly our family loved the Angel Wings. We felt the size, scale and symbol of the wings was most appropriate to honor the 58 and our beloved —.

Thank you all for your dedication and time ensuring the 58 and our loved ones are appropriately honored and not forgotten.

(Email End.)

Hi my name is — my mother was —. I've been thinking a lot about this and I looked at all the designs and they are all so beautiful, but my favorite would be the cluster of light poles with the photos :) I hope this helps I'm sorry I didn't know the name of it. Thank you all for the support and making this such a beautiful event!!

(Email End.)

Hello there,

I am a sister of —, one of the 58 victims and missed the chance to submit my vote for the online survey. I wanted to reach out and let you know that my choice would be for the design by JCJ. I really like their idea for the sheltered view of MGM
My second choice would be Olin.

Thank you for considering my opinion in the effort to make a lasting memorial.

(Email End.)

My name is —. — was my aunt. I want to thank everyone first for all they have given to this project and understanding the meaning behind it. I also want to thank all 5 project companies and all the have given as well. This was a very hard job for all of you and yet the hardest part is here. To decide which we like best. I love all of them but we can't have all of them so I'll give you what I really enjoyed.

First, I really did enjoy "A ribbon in the sand" by the Neubert Architect group. I love how it takes place both indoors and out. As you all know it can get very hot in Las Vegas. I love that it has space for community and discussions fellowship and it has an independent silence space. Most of all it has indoor shade. I really like the private interpretative space. Silence and solace space is my favorite space in this design. With the natural light halo that comes through daily. The individual flags are awesome inclusion of all.

Second, I really, really enjoyed the "Angel Wings " project from the Paul Murdoch Architect team. It is so beautiful. You can see it from above or down on the ground without it being "too much" as some didn't want it to be. My only concern would be the heat. Not much of space to cool down if needed. In theory it would be hard to enjoy such a beauty if someone is suffering in the heat, if that makes sense.

Third, I absolutely love the "Arc of Remembrance" from the SWA team. Even though it is not in order I believe this design is one of my favorites. I absolutely love how they incorporated the acoustic guitar in multiple ways. This design also has indoor space for shade out of the sun and heat. I love the idea of the shading on paper of each of our angels and the silent but natural halo of sunlight that comes through as well. The rosette garden looks amazing and colorful. I love how it's for all senses and abilities. I love the wall of embrace. My ultimate favorite is the rosette garden canopies. Beautiful expression. Love love this one.

Fourth, by JCJ Architect group, " forever one". I do like the outlay of this design. I like all the messeges everywhere. The statues all over the area. I liked the desert atmosphere. I enjoyed the glass art. I again love that there is indoor space. I love the standing "candles" for each 58. The remembrance wall was very beautiful.

Fifth, "The Memorial, bringing together opportunities to celebrate life. To remember. And to look forward together" by the Olin group. I absolutely love the idea of Healing Horses and the baby horses for our littles to be able to hug. However it just looked too hot. Everything is all outdoors. I just don't know about that. But I do love the idea.

(Email End.)

My name is —, mother of —.

I wanted to express how well I think the Infinity Design with the 58 candles would represent our loved ones.

The fact that there is a wall to shield the 58 candles made from the very earth where our loved ones lives were taken is incredible. It is so symbolic to me as the wall will shield the candles representing our loved ones from the Mandalay Bay in a way that we were not able to shield them that awful night.

My vote is definitely for them.

(Email End.)

Hello - This is —, — (1 of the 58) parents. We haven't really wanted to take part in a lot of the events that have taken place after that night. We have been healing in our own way. But we wanted to reach out and give our opinion (if you will take it) on the presentations of the 1 October memorial. I don't have the names of the companies in front of me, but I do remember the order they were presented. Before I get to that though, I would like to share something that happened to us the day before the presentations were happening.

We were contacted by — asking if we would be interested in attending the Anderson Cooper republican town hall meeting in NY to ask a question on gun control. (They wanted a family member of one of the victims to be apart of that and we promised ourselves we would do anything if it was a positive experience and would keep —'s name out there).

We were on the flight home from NY that day and I happened to look through the crack of the seats in front of me and I noticed a lady reading about the one October memorials. I looked at my wife and told her and my first thought was to say something to her when we landed, but my wife suggested that it would be a little creepy telling her, "hey, I was being snoopy and looked at what you were reading" so we didn't say anything. Come to find out when we were watching the presentations, she happened to be the lady in presentation # 2, JCJ architect.

I have regretted not saying anything since that day. Their presentation was beautiful and by far our favorite Since —'s passing, we have had many spiritual experiences and precious signs from him. We believe that seeing that lady on the plane that day was no coincidence. Especially after watching the presentations.

I know that this is a representation of all the 58 victims and not just —, but we felt like we needed to share that with the committee. Do what you will with this and we totally understand if you choose someone else, but we felt in our hearts we needed to share our thoughts. Thank you for your time, dedication and all your hard work putting this together for the victims.

(Email End.)

Expressing my support for the "Forever One" memorial

(Email End.)

Vote is Forever One

Please let me know if you have any questions.

(Email End.)

Upon looking at the selections my vote is for the

"Forever One" memorial

(Email End.)

Good day! We love presentation Stigsguard

The figure 8 with 58 flags at the end and each story beneath with light rotating to read each story, very powerful to us.

(Email End.)

My daughter, —, was one of the “58”. Memorial #3-Stigsgard is my favorite. I base this on the spirit of love, honor, loss and endearment portrayed by the light, the flow of the experience and the humanity represented. I think they successfully represented how I feel in my heart at the loss of my daughter in this horrible and senseless attack. I continue to always try to walk in the light of her spirit and thank these team members for their representation of that loss.

This memorial should represent a path for the observer to experience how deep the loss is. It is my prayer that all who attend will never have to know this loss personally. My hope is that we, as humans, after observing the memorial will become United in our efforts to stop this kind of INSANITY in the near future. Only through education can we prevent repetition of human failures.

(Email End.)

Hello,

My name is —, husband to the amazing wonderful angel of mine, —.

First off I would like to thank all the design teams for their incredible designs. Great job all of you. I feel that all 5 designs in their own unique way grasp the ideas that were discussed in the meetings. Your hard work is greatly appreciated.

My two picks, in no particular order are.

JcJ architecture

Aaron Neubert architects

I feel that these 2 designs spoke to me the most. They just feels right to me. Hopefully one of these gets pick for the memorial site.

I also would like to thank all the committee members for their hard work and dedication to this project. From the bottom of my heart, THANK YOU!!

In closing, Again great job all of you, no matter what happens know that you are all winners in my book.

(Email End.)

To Whom It May Concern,

My name is — and I am the Mother of —. On behalf of my entire family, we would like express our gratitude to all the design teams for the beautiful presentations given. They were all outstanding.

That being said, one team really stood out. The design from the JCJ Architecture Team was simply an expression of awe.

We loved the welcome... Glad You Are Here. Gladness ! The idea of using the sacred soil from the concert grounds to form a beautiful wall. One that will act as a screen to shield Mandalay Bay and also act as a buffer to the street noise. Brilliant ! We also loved the curved Angel Wall that will be illuminated at night. Magnificent! The Tower of Light with prisms and messages to the world etched into each pane of glass. Stunning ! The concept of the 22,000 points of light creating a concert atmosphere will be a sensational and stimulating. So Unique ! Then the walk to the Remembrance Rings where 58 candles are connected by 58 rings, 58 feet, and distance of again 58. SO LOVE THAT! Unity! We loved that perhaps the amphitheater may have performers, or maybe future annual Sunrise Memorials. Convenient! The unscripted arcs that connect landscaping & tree canopies, with emergency responders and the community through lyrics and inspiration. Support & Healing ! Last but certainly not least, upon entering... WE LOVED... October 1, 2017. We prefer that reference better than 1 October. Grateful!

(Email End.)

Dear Committee Members,

I have requested that this email be read at the July 26, 2023 meeting to ensure that these thoughts are read and heard before a final decision is made as to what two decisions will be submitted for consideration for the permanent memorial.

I believe, first and foremost, that you as a committee have made every effort to ensure our voices are heard in this process. There is no other way that building a permanent memorial would have been done properly. However, the latest survey concerning the five finalists designs for the memorial left much to be desired. To ask us a simple yes or no question as to whether each design met the criteria required was very disappointing. This left us no way to express our like or dislike of any designs, and in no way allowed us any input into what design would be chosen.

With that said, I believe it appropriate to express my thoughts in this manner. For your consideration, here are my thoughts on each design. I will list them in order in which I believe to be from most to least appropriate:

1. SWA Team - Resonant Memory: with numerous seating areas, the pavilion of unity, the wall of embrace, a shaded path of healing, numerous seating areas, the arc of remembrance and especially the rosette garden, the design encapsulates so many aspects important to our family. I remember the team telling us of the meaning of the rosettes, how each family would be able to design their own. How each person lost seems to still be there, yet just out of reach. THIS is how we each think of the 58 lost that night. Also, the use of a guitar design pulls in things you may not realize, such as the fact that one of Jason Aldean's guitarists was returned a guitar with a bullet hole in it, his guitar saved his life.

2. JCJ - Forever One: its many elements are quite well put together, and as such tell our story quite well. The reason I rank this second is because it does not do the same job in providing shading/cool areas. I believe its best consideration is the seating area around the 58 pillars of light.

3. Aaron Neubert Architects + studioSTIGSGAARD - A Ribbon in the Sand: While I appreciate the overall design, I am concerned about the numerous entrance/exit points. This brings up security issues for the memorial. Otherwise, it does a great job of telling the story.

4. Paul Murdoch Architects & Team - Winged Pavilion: While it does a wonderful job of representing each of the 58, I do not believe it does enough to tell the entire story.

5. OLIN + Andy Scott - I do not believe this design at all takes into account the many aspects of our story. That aside, a large concern comes in having numerous metal structures out in the desert sun. I'm not sure about how inviting that will be for children to touch, as some were indicated to be specifically designed to do. They would heat up in our desert sun, and people may be injured just touching them.

I know that you do not have to take all of our thoughts into consideration, but my hope is that by sending this, you will at least hear some considerations and concerns our family may have.

(Email End.)

Good afternoon,

My name is —. I am a Survivor of Route 91 and the Founder/CEO of 58 Strong. 58 Strong benefits the minor children that lost a parent in the shooting, as well as the survivors. I am writing with respect to the selection of the Design Team for the 1 October Memorial. As I understand it, the last survey results on the designs from the 5 Architectural Firms, is not the deciding factor in choosing a design team. I believe this needs to be corrected.

It's been over 5 years since the shooting. A night in which our lives were forever changed. And for the last 5 years, the Route 91 Family (survivors, first responders, supporters, and of course,

the 58 families') have waited and waited for this Memorial. This Memorial is a crucial aspect of our healing process. This memorial represents so much more than what happened that tragic night. It has been a battle for so many of us to do the normal things that we used to do. And the only people that know what we have battled, is us. This is why our votes from the last survey should be the deciding factor in selecting the Design Team. This is one area where we have earned the right to be selfish in this decision.

I urge Clark County to do the right thing and let the Route 91 Family have a voice.

(Email End.)

Good Morning,

Thank you 1 October Memorial Committee and Clark county for the 3 plus years of meetings to Forever remember our 58 on 10/1/17. This memorial will first and foremost Honor the 58. Support the families of the 58, survivors, first-responders, and community. We must Reflect, grieve, and remember. We must Commemorate the lost. We will Share stories and experiences here. A tower light "58" feet tall which is a beacon of light. The remembrance ring to honor the "58". The rammed wall meant to screen and block Mandalay Bay from view so people can enjoy the memorial and not be reminded of shots ringing from the from the hotel room that night. "58" Candles or totem structures which will refract light during the day and will illuminate light at night. The Angel Wall which is the back drop of the 58 lights. "22,000" points of light at the base of the sculpture that remembers the 22,000 there that night. The American flag, the Canadian flag, the State of Nevada flag, and The Route 91 Flag are honored. This soil which had tears shed on it, blood shed on it, lives lost on it will be used to form the rammed walls. This is sacred ground. When we touch the walls we will touch everything from that night. Interlocking rings connecting the 58 candles as one. Each candle is 58 inches on center from one another in a "58" foot diameter circle. Every detail is symbolic for the 58. This plays through the entire narrative of their story. On their Birthday each Angel can be honored with a specific light. Country music can be performed live as well as listened to through lights of country music through a cadence of lights. This memorial is symbolically crafted to Honor everyone that night but most importantly the 58. I feel this memorial will help everyone remember the 58 and it's importance to never forget the 58. This place will help us all live for the 58. I would like to Thank JCJ Architecture and their team for their hard work coming up with a memorial that Honors The 58 and everyone affected that night I will be forever grateful if this memorial is chosen.

(Email End.)

Hello,

I am —, mother of —, killed in the massacre. I want to thank all of the participants for all their hard work that went into each of the concepts. Every single one blessed me, each in their own way.

The one that stole my heart was from JCJ Architects. Your design is spectacular in every way. I cannot think of one thing you missed. I believe everyone who will visit for many, many years to

come will understand everything about that tragic night. Your design instills love, peace and honor for our 58 Angels. I have watched the video a number of times and I can't tell you the impact it has on me each time.

I am praying that your design wins out. I have walked through it virtually and can't wait for the day I can walk through it in person.

(Email End.)

To whom it may concern,

I would like this read at the meeting on July 25th.

As the daughter of —, one of the 58 angels, I believe that it is extremely important to have our voices heard in the decision of the permanent memorial at the site of the shooting. My family and friends took the time and effort to go through the survey that was given to us to choose one of the 5 displays that are up for vote. We went through it, we voted and our voices deserve to be heard. I believe that the survey that many family, friends, and survivors put their time and opinion into should be the biggest part of the vote for the winner of the permanent memorial that is said to be made. It is extremely unfair after going through the survey and having SO MANY family and friends vote as well to now be told our votes don't even count or matter. I strongly suggest you change this and have the survey be apart of this decision due to the fact WE as the family of the 58, friends of the 58, and survivors of 1 October are the ones that are going to cherish this close to our hearts.

(Email End.)

Dear Committee Members.

Thank you so much for your hard work in ensuring that the process around the selection process for the builders of the Oct 1 permanent memorial involved the families of the 58, as well as survivors and other interested parties.

I spent time with each group ahead of their proposals and gave feedback and advice and comments to each team. They were receptive and grateful for the input in all cases.

Although we could not review the proposed builds in person, I appreciated the opportunity to watch the live presentations and spent 4-5 hours doing so.

Later we were asked to give our feedback in a survey and we were happy to do so, in spite of the fact that they were all excellent and well thought out and it was hard to choose!

Today we heard that our feedback in that survey was deemed irrelevant and that it was not being taken into consideration. I find this odd as we were specifically asked for feedback and we did our due diligence and responded accordingly.

How could it be that this survey is not being used as input into the final decision?

This is disappointing and I hope that it is not the case. Please confirm that our feedback is relevant and important information that should be given careful consideration.

(Email End.)

To the committee, we are — the parents of —, one of the 58 Angels. We have put our vote in for the design team SWA we hope that our voices are heard. We want to thank each and every team for all of the work and heart that has been put into each design. Our vote for the design team SWA is chosen for the detail in the beautiful rings along with the ability to scan each individual ring and learn about the lives of our 58 Angels. Also they put careful thought into the blocking of the (unnamed hotel) from view while visiting the memorial, this being very important to the healing experience all of us will be embracing as we visit. Again we hope our voices are heard in this very touching close to our hearts memorial honoring our precious daughter — and the other 57 Angels. Thank you for your consideration, —

(Email End.)

To whom this may concern,

My husband and I were at the Route 91 shooting. We have seen the designs and truly believe that the ultimate decision should come from the survivors/ families. We hope you will please keep that in the forefront of your final decision as it is particularly important to all who was impacted. God Bless You! 

(Email End.)